

## The History Textbook Controversy: An Annotated Bibliography

デラ・リック

Rick Derrah

The history textbook controversy has been an issue of debate since the end of the Second World War and it continues today. This annotated bibliography identifies works related to the background of the textbook controversy, current topics of debate within textbooks, textbooks in-use, and other works on a similar theme outside of Japan.

**Key Words** : History, Textbooks, Education

This annotated bibliography is centered on the theme of textbooks and provides information on various works including books, textbooks, articles, and reports providing information on the history textbook issue within Japan. Each reference also includes information to help the reader identify nature of the information as related to textbooks.

With the occupation of Japan at the end of World War Two, textbooks in Japan underwent a radical change as the Supreme Command for Allied Powers (SCAP) officials eliminated sections of books considered to be a hindrance to the development of democracy in Japan. A second change occurred in the 1950's with the end of the occupation. Finally with a third round of textbook changes in the 1980's the issues have become international and the center of media attention continuing today. This bibliography is divided into several sections including the history of textbooks, historical points of debate in textbooks, and finally some additional books which discuss the general debate on history's presentation in textbooks.

### The History of Textbooks in Japan from Occupation

This section covers changes in Japanese high school textbooks from the occupation with a focus on educational policies developed during the occupation period.

*Anderson, Ronald S. (1975). Education in Japan: A Century of Modern Development. Washington, U.S. Government Printing Office*

This book provides an overview of the Japanese educational system from feudal to modern times with an emphasis on contemporary educational organization. The last section of the book entitled "major problems" discusses the changes in textbook censorship and authorization from the 1950's to the 1960's.

*Beauchamp, Edward R., James M. Vardaman Jr. (1994). Japanese Education Since 1945: A Documented Study. New York, M.E. Sharpe*

This is a collection of documents concerning education with three documents in particular providing an interesting insight into textbooks in Japan. The first document, "Plan for Educational Control in Japan under Military Occupation", describes the intentions of the occupation forces, but also describes actions taken by the Ministry of Education after the end of the war but before occupation. The second document, "Revision of the Japanese Educational System" issued by the US Department of State in 1947, provides a list of subjects not allowed in textbooks along with objectives for new textbooks. The third document, "Reform of Elementary and Secondary Education" written in 1987 by the National Council on Educational Reform includes detailed information on the system of textbook authorization.

*Beauchamp, Edward R. (1991). Windows on Japanese Education. Westport, Greenwood Publishing Group*

Provides an overview of education trends from early history to the present day. The focus of this book is on current issues in education such as the teaching of math or science and teacher training, but there is an interesting section on education reform in the 1980's.

*Caiger, John (1969). "Ienaga Saburo and the First Postwar Japanese History Textbook." Modern Asian Studies 3(1)*

This article describes the initial changes to textbook policy from 1946 and the development of the first postwar textbook *Kuni no Ayumi* written in just five months and published in October of 1946. Ienaga Saburo was responsible for writing the section on ancient history which before the end of the war had provided the foundation of imperial ideology for schoolchildren. Caiger shows Saburo as a defender of the changes made in 1946 which led him to take the government to court in the 1960's over the issue of textbook certification.

*Cummings, William K. (1980). Education and Equality in Japan. Princeton, Princeton University Press*

Thesis –education after the war had contributed to equality among adults in various terms including the workplace, home, etc. Discusses general trends in social studies textbooks by each year of high school. Students are first introduced to workers they may come into contact in their neighborhoods and then the companies which deal with these workers. Finally the student is shown the link between the companies discussed earlier and their relation to the environment with an emphasis on the issue of pollution.

*Goodman, Grant K., Nagayo Homma, Tetsuo Najita, and James M. Becker. (1983). "The Japan/United States Textbook Study Project: Perceptions in the Textbooks of Each Country about the History of the Other." The History Teacher 16(4)*

The Japan/United States Textbook Study Project surveyed 14 Japanese and 28 American social studies textbooks and looked at the perceptions contained in these books about each other. Some of the findings related to the theme of this bibliography included the fact that both US and Japanese textbooks

oversimplified the causes of the Second World War and that while the treatment of Japan and the US in each other's textbook was generally accurate a lot of the information was based on stereotypes.

*Shibata, Masako. (2005). Japan and Germany under the U.S. Occupation: A Comparative Analysis of the Post-War Education Reform. Lanham. Lexington Books*

This book provides a description of the education reforms implemented by the occupation forces both in Japan and Germany after the end of the Second World War. Focusing on textbooks, this book, details the different strategies used in an effort to eliminate the use of wartime textbooks and the how these result differed in both Japan and Germany.

*Thakur, Yoko H. (1995). "History Textbook Reform in Allied Occupied Japan, 1945-52." History of Education Quarterly 35(1)*

Thakur provides an analysis of textbook policies during occupation and shows that these policies still remain a large part of the textbook debate even after 1952. She follows the policies and links them to the recent attempts by Ienaga Saburo to fight the changes required by the Ministry of Education in his high school history textbook. There is also an interesting account of the discussion of how to deal with the creation myth in textbooks.

*Trainor, Joseph C. (1983). Educational Reform in Occupied Japan. Tokyo, Meisei University*

This book is the memoir of Joseph Trainor who worked for the Textbook branch of the Civil Information and Education Section within General Headquarters and provides a detailed account of his seven years in Japan. Contains several chapters detailing the development of textbooks during the occupation. While not directly related to textbooks, there is also a very interesting discussion of the attempt to replace kanji with romanji.

*Hicks, George (1998). Japan's War Memories: Amnesia or Concealment. Brookfield, Ashgate*

A detailed chronology of the controversial issues surrounding textbooks with an interesting counter to, what the author describes as, right wing revisionist counterattacks to changes in textbooks. Some of these counterattacks include debates on the denial of the Nanking Massacre and the meaning of the Tokyo

## War Crime Trials.

*The Japanese Education Reform Council (1950). Education Reform in Japan. Tokyo, The Japanese Education Reform Council*

This report was written by a group of Japanese educators who organized to cooperate with the American Education Mission which visited Japan in 1946. It discusses many of the issues in Joseph C Trainor's Educational Reform in Occupied Japan (1983) cited above, but is largely a positive reaction to the findings of the American Education Mission. The last sections of the report states that funding is the greatest problem in implementing education reform and throughout the report there is accounts of spending. A roster of members of the council and their fulltime positions beyond the council is also interesting.

*Saburo, Ienaga. (2001). Japan's Past Japan's Future. Lanham, Rowman and Littlefield*

This is the story of Ienaga Saburo and describes his education from elementary school through university. Ienaga is perhaps most well known for the events described in the second half of the book, his lawsuits over textbook certification. He went to court after a textbook he wrote was rejected by a textbook authorizing committee, challenging the constitutionality of the textbook authorization system. The first court case in 1962 was in response to the 260 required changes in his textbook as stated by the textbook committee and called for freedom of expression and academic freedom. The court found that the certification system was constitutional. In his second case Ienaga was told to rewrite six sections of his book, went to court, and won with the decision stating denial to certify a textbook based on historical interpretations was censorship. The ruling was later overturned. The third court case was based on a rejection of Ienaga's textbook due to his wording. He used "invasion of China" instead of "advance into" as well as describing the Nanking as a massacre instead of an incident. He lost the case.

*The Japanese Society for History Textbook Reform (1998). The Restoration of a National History. Tokyo, The Japanese Society for History Textbook Reform*

This booklet produced by the Society for History Textbook Reform states its objective is to produce a new history textbook with several changes from

current textbooks. This group also states that Japanese history should be taught strictly from a Japanese perspective and argues that such topics as comfort women should not be included in textbooks. The reasons cited not including information on the comfort women includes an argument against the historical accuracy of the comfort women story and also an argument based on pedagogy.

*Hein, Laura and Mark Selden. (2000). Censoring History: Citizenship and Memory in Japan, Germany, and the United States. New York, M.E.Sharpe*

This book compares and contrasts the attempts in Japan, Germany, and the United States as they try to use education to develop a democratic society while confronting issues in history textbooks. While there is a large amount of material on history in Japanese history textbooks there is also an interesting discussing of the representation of the Vietnam War in US history textbooks.

*Benfell, Steven T. (2002). "Why Can't Japan Apologize? Institutions and War Memory since 1945." Harvard Asian Quarterly 6(2)*

This article explains an interesting group of factors which have worked to limit change in history education and to also pressure for a nondirect approach to issues surrounding the Second World War. Some of these factors include alternate views of the war, revisionist interest groups, politicization of the past, and the sense of victim hood.

*Murdo, Pat. (1996). Textbook controversies in Japan: How dead are they? Japan Economic Institute Report (5A)*

In addition to providing a general history of the textbook issue within Japan, Murdo's book gives interesting examples of the phrasing used by Ienaga Saburo in his textbooks along with the requested changes and reasons for these changes from the textbook authorization authorities.

*Taro, Yayama. (1983). "The Newspapers Conduct a Mad Rhapsody over the Textbook Issue." Journal of Japanese Studies 9(2)*

In the early 1980's the term "invasion" of China was changed to "advance into" China by a committee authorizing school textbooks. This became a major news story involving not just the change but also

the relationship between the Ministry of Education and the Japan Teachers Union, the authorization process, and foreign reaction to the change. This article discusses these various facets of the controversy arguing a defense of the authorization system and against bowing to foreign pressure concerning changes in the wording of textbooks.

*Okano, Kaori and Motonori Tsuchiya (1999). Education in Contemporary Japan: Inequality and Diversity. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press*

This book states diversity in relationships between schools, individuals, and society has created inequality. The Japan Teachers Union or Nikkyoso (*nihon kyoshokuin kumiai*) is described as making a stand together for a democratic state forcing it into conflict with the Ministry of Education over textbooks issues.

*Dower, John W. (2002). "An Aptitude for Being Unloved: War and Memory in Japan". Crimes of War: Guilt and Denial in the Twentieth Century. Omer Bartov, Atina Grossman, and Mary Nolan. New York, The New York Press*

Dower discusses some of the issues surrounding the perception that Japan, unlike Germany, has not accepted war responsibility. He focuses on aspects involved in this debate including denial of aggression with wartime propaganda, moral arguments based on the idea of victor's justice, and the feeling of victimization which all together work to hinder a full acceptance of war responsibility as requested by some groups.

*Wray, Harry (2000). "The Fall of Moral Education and the Rise and Decline of Civics Education and Social Studies in Occupied Japan." Japan Forum 12(1)*

Before the end of the Second World War, one subject taught in schools, *shushin*, played an important part in teaching students imperial ideology. After the end of the war the occupation forces wanted to replace *shushin* with social studies. With the end of the occupation, however, there was a shift away from social studies. This article describes the complex interaction between various occupation and Ministry of Education officials concerning this subject. It also presents the confusion between the different objectives of a civics course and social studies course as seen by both sides.

## Historical Issues in Textbooks

This section looks at some of the issues which are points of contention in history textbooks. Most of these issues are based on events from the Second World War.

*Chang, Iris. (1997). The Rape of Nanking. New York, Basic Books*

The latter half of the book provides some discussion of Nanking in Japanese history textbooks stating that there is an academic cover-up of the issue as well as censorship by the media and some government agencies such as the police.

*Henson, Maria Rosa (1999). Comfort Women: A Philipina's Story of Prostitution and Slavery under the Japanese Military. Lanham, Rowman and Littlefield*

The story of Rosa Henson in the Philippines during the war and her subsequent court case against the Japanese government in the 1990s

*Hicks, George (1994). The Comfort Women. New York, W.W. Norton and Company*

History of the comfort women during the war with sections on various countries such as Vietnam and Burma. The personal stories of some people who were comfort women are also included. The discussion of postwar reaction includes reactions by both the government and society.

*Saburo, Ienaga. (1978). The Pacific War 1931-1945. New York, Random House*

Ienaga's book on the war provides a perspective which has been criticized as being almost pro-communist. One section he describes the ultimate defeat of Japan as being attributed to the democracy of the Chinese people with some material help by the United States. There is a large focus on the conflict between Japan and China in this work.

*Tanaka, Yuki (2002). Japan's Comfort Women: Sexual Slavery and Prostitution during World War II and the US Occupation. New York, Routledge*

This book details the sexual exploitation of women in Korea and Dutch women in Indonesia. It also describes the violence against Japanese women during the occupation by US and Australian troops.

## R.Derrah, The History Textbook Controversy: An Annotated Bibliography

Links are made between the comfort women situation and the development of a military prostitution system during the occupation

*Yamamoto, Masahiro. (2000). Nanking: Anatomy of an Atrocity. Westport, Praeger*

Written after Iris Chang's *The Rape of Nanking* this book describes its intention as countering the idea that the incident was a planned action by the military but instead a tragedy of war. It also provides an account of the changes in textbooks concerning the Nanking incident.

### Current Japanese History Textbooks

These two books have been used in Kawachinagano City in Osaka Prefecture. The two textbooks take different approaches to some of the issues mentioned earlier in this bibliography. In addition to the wording, it is quite interesting to look at picture selection in these texts as compared to US history books dealing with the same subjects.

*Kirihara Shoten. (2003). Shin Nihonshi A. Tokyo, Kirihara Shoten*

This is the history textbook currently used by a public high school in Kawachinagano City, Osaka Prefecture. In reference to Nanking, this book uses the term *nankin daigyakkusatsu jiken* or Great Nanking Massacre. This provides an interesting contrast to the term used by another high school in the same city. This other book can be found below: Yamamoto Shupansha. (2003). Syosetsu Nihonshi

*Yamamoto Shupansha. (2003). Syosetsu Nihonshi. Tokyo, Yamamoto Shupansha*

This is a high school history textbook used by the private school located in Kawachinagano City, Osaka Prefecture. The issue of the comfort women is discussed in a footnote and explains that women were collected but does not specify their activity. Concerning Nanking this text uses the term *nankin jiken* or Nanking incident.

### Other Books

The debate on what to include and how it should be represented is not unique to Japan. While these books are not related to the issue of Japanese textbooks they do provide an insight into the current discussion of the representation of history in high

school textbooks in countries beyond Japan.

*Eisner, Elliot W. (1997). "Who Decides What Schools Teach".*

*The Curriculum Studies Reader. David J. Flinders and Stephen J. Thornton. New York, Routledge*

*Jennings, John E. (1997). "School Based Reform on What is Taught and Learned".*

*The Curriculum Studies Reader. David J. Flinders and Stephen J. Thornton. New York, Routledge*

*Loewen, James H. (1995). Lies My Teacher Told Me: Everything Your American History Textbook Got Wrong. New York, Touchstone*

*Spring, Joel. (2000). American Education. Boston, McGraw-Hill*